



BALTIC JOURNAL OF LAW & POLITICS

A Journal of Vytautas Magnus University
VOLUME 15, NUMBER 1 (2022)
ISSN 2029-0454



Cite: *Baltic Journal of Law & Politics* 15:1 (2022): 1859-1875
DOI: 10.2478/bjlp-2022-00118

Features and prospects of the constitutional control body activity on constitutionalism formation in the Republic of Kazakhstan

Mukhtar Baktybekov

Senior Lecturer of the Department of State and Legal Disciplines; Alikhan Bokeikhan University, Faculty of Law, Department of State and Legal Disciplines.

Address: 071400, Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey, Mangilik el st. 11.

ORCID: 0000-0001-9297-4846

Email: mukhtar-79@mail.ru

Assel Sakabaykyzy

Master of Law, Department of International Law, Kazakh Ablaihan University of International Relations and World Languages

Email: assel_taldik@mail.ru

Maigul Matayeva

Doctor of Law, Alikhan Bokeikhan University, Faculty of Law, Department of State and Legal Disciplines.

Address: 071400, Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey, Mangilik el st. 11.

ORCID: 0000-0003-4347-0128

Email: maigulm@mail.ru

Eldana Maishekina

Head of the Department of State Legal Disciplines, PhD, Alikhan Bokeikhan University, Faculty of Law, Department of State and Legal Disciplines.

Address: 071400, Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey, Mangilik el st. 11.

ORCID: 0000-0003-1289-7890

Email: Eldana_18@mail.ru

Aidos Zhumadilov

Senior Lecturer of the Department of State and Legal Disciplines; Alikhan Bokeikhan University, Faculty of Law, Department of State and Legal Disciplines.

Address: 071400, Republic of Kazakhstan, Semey, Mangilik el st. 11.

ORCID: 0000-0001-9439-620X

Email: aidos_2010@bk.ru

Aliya Koshkinbayeva

PhD, Jurisprudence and International Law Department, Turan University, Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty.

ORCID: 0000-0002-9327-9869

Email: ankin2008@bk.ru

Bolatbek Tleulov

Head of the Department of State Legal Disciplines, Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, M. Auezov South KAZAKHSTAN University.

Shymkent, Tauke khan avenue, 5

Email: 3136363@mail.ru

Abstract

Constitutional development and ensuring the supremacy of the Constitution will be one of the main issues today. At the same time, a special place is occupied by the activities of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan. As a result of subsequent constitutional reforms, he will have advantages in forming constitutionalism within his powers and will continue to theoretically and practically ensure the protection of the Constitution. Analysis, interpretation, verification of constitutional norms, separation of powers between authorities, and constitutional conclusions on important Council events will shape the constitutional process, law enforcement practice and orientation in the country, form legal institutions and development mechanisms of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a democratic, legal state and legislative framework. The research will reveal the function and significance of the constitutional control body based on the principles and values of constitutionalism, which is our goal. In particular, the experience and importance of the Constitutional Council in the formation of constitutional legislation in the country based on universal constitutional values and Kazakh values are described.

Keywords

constitutionalism, constitutional values and principles, the rule of law, institute of constitutional control, Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, normative resolutions of the Constitutional Council, legal positions

Introduction

In the current era of globalization, with the formation of civilizations and each state's constitutional development, establishing a regime of "constitutionalism" is essential. Constitutionalism is a conceptual, theoretical idea that considers the development of the state in a sustainable, evolutionary way. The category of "constitutionalism" is a cumulative value that is theoretically and practically enriched in terms of content, requires actual implementation in practice, creates mutual harmony between the state and the individual, and is constantly dynamic. The legal doctrine of "constitutionalism" consists of the theory and idea of constitutionalism and the practice of its implementation. The theory of

constitutionalism consists of knowledge about the theories of the Constitution, constitutional evolution, constitutional reform and important democratic values in Kazakhstan. Suppose constitutional ideas are expressed through values and constitutional statements. In that case, the practice of constitutionalism is given as an actual historical experience of the implementation of democratic norms in a certain period of the constitutional development of Kazakhstan [1; 54-55].

At the same time, constitutionalism is represented in the action and development of constitutional norms, relations, institutions, and structures in a generalized form.

In the system of current law in the state, the main tasks include the formation of a unified system of the Constitution and normative acts formed on its basis, effective constitutional legislation and the practice of their implementation and application, "constantly improving and preparing mechanisms for the introduction of constitutional norms and principles, ideas and values into a living system of public practice is the task of jurisprudence" [2; page 5]

In Kazakh constitutionalism's process, constitutional justice and control function is particular.

The doctrinal and legal positions of the constitutional control body of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the interpretation of the norms of the Constitution, resolution of constitutional and legal disputes between state authorities, substantive enrichment of constitutional norms, messages and proposals related to constitutional practice on the application of constitutional norms, constitutional and legal decisions and conclusions are essential for constitutionalism and the constitutional process (development) of the country.

The Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, acting within its powers as the only body ensuring the supremacy and control of the Constitution, has formed a regime of constitutionalism and paved the way for the realization of the right to protection and development. The Constitution and constitutional values, with their deep scientific foundations, effective institutions and mechanisms, theory and practice of constitutional control in the Republic of Kazakhstan, establish its primacy, and they allow us to be among the developed countries in the conditions of modern globalization, overcoming external and internal threats and risks.

Methods

General scientific and individual methods of objective reality cognition were used to study the topic. From the point of view of metaphysics, by general philosophical methods, constitutionalism looks at the state and principles as values that should exist. From the point of view of dialectics, it gives dynamic concepts full of contradictory changes. In particular, constitutionalism and other categories close to it develop based on contradictions.

At the same time, the meaning and content of objects studied by general scientific methods according to modern knowledge are revealed through

synthesis, and the general goal of systematization of values in constitutionalism through constitutional control is shown (the content of constitutional control is disclosed).

Systemic methods of constitutional control reach their level when they are closely related to other elements (constitutional norms, principles, institutions, jurisprudence, culture, tradition), and functional methods reveal the institutional capabilities and legal experience of the constitutional control body of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In the same way, different scientific methods were used. Using historical methods, objective conclusions are drawn with an in-depth analysis of past situations, the historical development of constitutional and legal phenomena is considered, and the continuity and trend of the development of constitutional regulation are studied. Similarly, with the system-structural method, each legal institution has its structure and is part of the general science. Based on comparative methods, a theoretical comparison of the national foundations of constitutionalism and constitutional control with the world trend and the connections of these objects in the system of law in other branches of law are considered. It is shown that the interrelationships between them through system and integrity coexist with constitutionalism and constitutional control, which are complementary, necessary values.

Discussion

The method of constitutional development, or constitutionalism, is based primarily on constitutional thinking, constitutional theory, and constitutional doctrine. Secondly, it includes the experience of the actual implementation of constitutional legislation in life. The closer these two aspects are to each other, the maintenance of a close relationship will reflect true constitutionalism. The political and socio-economic situation of countries that have reached a high level of constitutional development will develop. At the same time, in the conditions of the rapid progress of globalization and integration, the relevance of universal values and modern trends, the priorities of world constitutionalism are accepted by States as universal values (universal benefits).

The concept of constitutionalism was first formed in American theory as a concept asserting the dominance in the society of the written fundamental law of the state - the Constitution. As a result, it regulated, recognized and preserved all relationships as the highest value in society. In the same way, it is considered to reveal the primary importance of constitutionalism in the development of human thought, in political and legal thought, in the development of the state and society, as a mechanism for limiting the power of the monarch, the state of power, as well as the concept of a state limited by human rights.

It can be concluded that constitutionalism is a process (direction) of recognizing and realizing relevant and essential values for humanity in the

course of the historical development of humanity (constitutional and historical development). The essence of all these positions is establishing the rule of law. It can be said that in the Anglo-Saxon legal system, the concept of the "rule of law" by A. Dicey is similar to the "rule of the constitution".

Currently, the activities of constitutional justice are carried out by the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan to ensure the supremacy of the fundamental law as much as possible, to form meaningful constitutional opinions and thinking based on its values and principles, to maximize its potential, to determine the closest legal positions between natural law and positive law and to ensure constitutional practice.

Ignoring the achievements of theoretical ideas in the field of legal construction leads to the omission of what is essential from the point of view of human well-being and society. One of the forms of such theoretical reflections is the problem of legal interpretation. They are aimed at legal recognition and determination of the necessary content. One of the most necessary conditions for implementing the law is its understanding, comprehension, judgment, understanding of its meaningful meaning and achieving its meaning in regulation. This logical operation is called in science the interpretation of the law. It depends on the goals and interests of the participants at different levels, by different methods, depending on the clarity of the laws, intellectual and other levels of the subjects of cognition. Therefore, it is necessary to interpret the law at a high level of responsibility, intelligence and organization, academician S.Z. Zimanov points out [3; 6-7].

Modern problems of constitutionalism. Constitutionalism is a set of various ideas, principles, and concepts aimed at the development of the political and legal system of the state, aimed at the realization of human and civil rights and freedoms and, as a consequence, ensuring the rule of law [4]. Kazakh constitutionalism is at certain stages in the course of historical development in the formation of values (components of the state and society) aimed at democratic foundations. Under the Kazakh Khanate, property, family, and other legal issues were regulated based on customary law by such basic laws as the "Seven Regulations (Jeti jargı)", etc. The restriction of the tsar's omnipotence within tsarist Russia, the supremacy of the state's fundamental law, the establishment of self-determination of peoples within Russia, and the preservation of land ownership of the local population. During the Soviet period, the question of human rights and freedoms and the creation of state power in adopting and implementing Union constitutions. In the creation of independent Kazakhstan, democratic values acquired a new character, forming new formational values and forming branches of government in strengthening statehood, protection and recognition of human rights and freedoms, etc. The formation of values and ideas led to a new stage of social harmony, political stability, economic development based on the well-being of the people, and constitutional development based on Kazakh patriotism.

Researchers consider two aspects of the concept of constitutionalism: - one is objectively based on the general legal principles of the organization of public administration;

- in a subjective sense, it reflects the traditions and mentality of the political and legal culture of the state-forming society. Constitutionalism in the Western tradition is defined as a state power that restricts absolute power based on the norms of the Constitution or a democratic position that restricts the absolute regime.

Moral and ethical values in the history of Turkic and nomadic Kazakhs are based on the values of the Turkic and Kazakh khanates - homeland, native language, native culture, and tolerant attitude to other nationalities and religions. They continue with values such as conscience, based on the deep traditions of the Kazakh people, continuing the current presidential form of government in Kazakhstan, being the basis for the formation of the constitutional system [5; 20-21-p.]. They are not only legal statements but also become vital moral and ethical (value) principles of the younger generation. German researcher S. Voit notes that constitutionalism should not be understood only with the Constitution in force in the state. As a normative concept, it gives a multi-level system that goes beyond the Constitution and even beyond the law, reflecting the way of life and the particular mentality of the people [6]. Therefore, the constitutional position put forward by "a strong executive power, a responsible parliament, a professional court" will become the norm of life for Kazakhstan's democracy and modern Kazakhstanis. It will be considered from the position of "a strong president- an influential parliament- an accountable government" and from the position of a "hearing state" in Kazakhstan's political and legal process to protect moral and ethical human criteria.

V. Malinovsky, a member of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, defines constitutionalism as consisting of classical canons and recommendations of international experts and of the importance of both visible and valuable domestic experience and the way of the state through natural relations. This shows that "a unique methodology and methodology for the development of constitutional processes are being formed in the domestic constitutional experience of our country [7]. Such constitutional values are the stabilizing, developing and guiding foundations of our state and society and continue to shape constitutionalism. It is essential not to look at the Constitution or its norms only as written documents but to understand its idea and deep content, as well as its axiological values, to form respect and culture among subjects for the provisions of the Constitution. It will allow the Constitution to be implemented at a high level.

The strengthening of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan as summing up the values of the basic ideas of the state and society, independent statehood, market economy, democracy, legal system, united Kazakh people,

socio-political stability and peace, harmony is the result of the supremacy of the Constitution and the realization of its values and constitutional development how norms and principles are defined in the Constitution: the people of Kazakhstan, united by common historical destiny; the creation of statehood on the native Kazakh land; creation of a peaceful civil society based on freedom, equality and consent; becoming a worthy member of the world community; the right of the people to sovereignty [8]. Democratic, legal, secular, creation of a social state, human rights, freedom, life, recognition of the state and man as a shared value, and article 1, paragraph 2 of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan mentions social harmony and political stability, economic development for the benefit of the whole people, Kazakh patriotism, essential issues of the state, the basic principles of democratic decision-making, including a national referendum and Parliament, which will determine the effectiveness, strength and viability of the Constitution and strengthen the system of constitutionalism in the country.

The domestic scientist A.K. Kotov considered Kazakh constitutionalism based on the path of the rule of law and civil society; individual autonomy and economic freedom of society and democratic political regime; secular and republican phenomena based on national sovereignty, private property, economic freedom, separation of powers; inseparable rights and freedoms of man and citizen [9; p.80-82]. According to Kazakh scientist A.T. Ascheulov, the supremacy of the Constitution and the creation of effective mechanisms for its implementation, which is, first of all, the protection of citizens from unlawful actions of state bodies with the Constitution, the creation of a sovereign, democratic secular state based on the principles of liberalism, individualism, statehood and private property [10; p.110]. Scientist S.K.Amandykova identifies such constitutional characteristics as the rule of law, popular consent (will), limited government, separation of powers, open civil society, personal inviolability, regulatory approval, equality, continuity, honesty [11; pp.27-64].

In the course of increasing global threats and tensions, the importance of constitutional values, which are the basis of constitutional development, increases, and there is a need for society to enrich them in a new way.

Constitutionalism is presented by researchers as a complex system of interrelated components with a system of fundamental values and ideas (principles). It is determined that acting in the unity of these principles, Kazakhstan's statehood will be the key and direction of conflict-free development and public welfare.

The Constitutional Council shows the importance of values and principles in Kazakhstan's constitutionalism in its resolutions defining their unique significance in the formation and evolution of man and citizen, society, and state in the new history of Kazakhstan. In its activities, the Constitutional Council relies on the values mentioned above in constitutional development, directs them and forms constitutional law on their basis. The core of our constitutional

development will be constitutional values and principles adopted by our constitutional tradition based on national constitutional experience and mentality (social and cultural foundations). They are intensely perceived in society as moral and ethical values, increase the strength of the Constitution and constitutionalism, and ensure the integration of universal values with Kazakhstan's constitutional practice, constitutional structure and stability of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

On the one hand, the constitutional value of Kazakhstan reflects our past path (experience) and our future dreams and goals, and on the other hand, lays the foundations of the constitutional system that ensures the stability of our state and society and determines the meaning of life. The axiological foundations and methods presented in the development and theory of constitutionalism (constitutional and legal science) will serve as the basis for the development, stability, security and harmony of the state and society, will indicate ways to overcome obstacles, threats, and crises. The axiological or value-oriented framework, being both continuous and innovative, opens up new opportunities for the theory of constitutional law and constitutional law enforcement; and the "evaluative measurement" is an essential tool or method of constitutional legal practice for effective constitutional monitoring [12].

For constitutionalism, it is essential to adopt a legitimate and legitimate constitution with its effective implementation and, above all, to maintain a balance between the legal Constitution (compliance with the letter and spirit of the fundamental law) and the actual Constitution (real life) [13; p.13]. One of the most critical processes is the correct understanding, interpretation, protection and implementation of the Constitution, constitutional values, norms and principles in society.

In recent years, the relevance of these bodies has increased, they carry out macro-regulation of the legal system, and their decisions are corrective in the implementation of the norms of the Constitution. The Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, checking the compliance of the current legislation with the Constitution, forms legal positions in the form of universal foundations and instruments of various forms that effectively affect the current law.

The decisions of the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan contain a synthesis of legislation and legal doctrine. Legal positions are the unity of legal information of ideas and norms formed on various issues, logically completed, in the content of decisions of the constitutional control bodies. The legal position sets out assumptions and knowledge on legal policy, law, and the Constitution, and indicates the origins of issues, their results, work experience, and the collective legal consciousness of members of the Constitutional Council [14; pp.9-13]. Legal positions also retain a systematic knowledge of the content of the Constitution, legal policy and the system of legislation with the constitutional control body in a particular historical period, and also retain in the future a set of legal information and historical experience, their own decisions and

amendments. The legal positions of the constitutional control bodies are also necessary to protect legal borders, legal and political-legal institutions, and legal relations. They hinder the development of public relations in unnecessary areas, recognize specific ideas and values, or contribute to the transformation of law, jurisprudence, and legal relations [15; p.11].

The legal positions approved and identified in the decision of the constitutional control body are stable, systematic, and logical sources in the interpretation of the Constitution norms, as well as a way and means of its protection and implementation. They are based on a general logical, value, political and legal theoretical position and reflect the logic of the argumentation of this state body and have motivational, prognostic and preventive value on legal issues. The legal positions of the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan ensure the advance of legislation or the inhibition of public relations, influence legal policy and direct legislators and law enforcement practice in a particular direction. Therefore, legal positions in regulatory resolutions will continue to ensure the constitutional development of theory and practice with professional doctrinal logic in the implementation and supremacy of the Constitution. Therefore, it is necessary to take into account the importance of legal positions not only in the conclusions but also in the descriptive (analytical) part of the normative resolutions of the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan. Unfortunately, in practice, it turns out that the leading positions are not fully applied in the implementation of specific provisions of the legislation.

After the adoption of the Law "On Amendments and Additions to the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan" concerning constitutional reforms by the Parliament in 2017, it was sent to the Constitutional Council by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan to verify "compliance with the values and basic principles of the republic established by the Constitution" [16]. As a new initiative of the third constitutional reform, essential changes and additions for our country were aimed at ensuring the supremacy of the Constitution in the current legal system and its unconditional implementation and enforcement throughout the country, improving public administration, strengthening constitutional rights and freedoms of citizens and fulfilling duties. Also, this constitutional law determined the priority of ratified international treaties over the laws of the Republic, the application of international treaties to which Kazakhstan is a party [17]. The Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan confirms that amendments and additions to the Constitution of the Republic are made under the basic principles of the Republic, such as independence and unity of the state, its form of government and under paragraph 2 of Article 91 of the Constitution. It is determined that "it is aimed at ensuring the supremacy of the existing legal system and its unconditional implementation throughout the country, improving public administration, strengthening the protection of constitutional rights and freedoms of citizens" [18]. It means that the constitutional justice body ensures the constitutional

process within its constitutional powers, checks the compliance of the law with the Constitution and ensures the legal system's unity. Based on this, the way was paved to a new stage of the state's constitutional development.

In the direction of democratic modernization of the presidential power in our country, several changes have been made to strengthen the role, independence and responsibility of the Parliament and the government, the reorganization of individual powers between the President, Parliament, and the government. To strengthen the status of the Parliament as the highest legislative body of the country, the powers of the Parliament were expanded with the rejection of the Head of State powers such as issuing laws and decrees, exercising legislative powers granted by the Parliament, the refusal of the authority to instruct the government to submit a bill to the Majilis of the Parliament [19], the President's influence on the adoption of laws were preserved only in areas requiring urgent organization. At the same time, the powers of the Parliament over the government have been expanded, and the mechanisms of control and influence on the executive power of people's representatives are being improved. The right to submit candidacies of members of the government to the Head of State after consultations with the Majilis, the right to terminate the powers of the government before the newly elected Majilis, the accountability and control of the Government before Parliament, the right to appeal to the President to dismiss members of the government by at least two-thirds of the votes of deputies, etc. The changes have defined new foundations for improving the efficiency of the branches of government.

These changes and constitutional values are the basis for the formation of independent Kazakhstan as a state with a powerful and developed civil society, complementing the fundamental principles of the country, enriching its content and corresponding to the historical evolution of the country, further establishing democracy and preserving the government form of the President, strengthening the responsibilities of Parliament and government. Authorizing the President of the Republic to send the Constitutional Council submission on the verification of the constitutionality of a law or other legal act that entered into force based on subparagraph 3) of paragraph 6 of Article 1 of the Law (subparagraph 10-1 of Article 44 and paragraph 2 of Article 72 of the Constitution) and amendments and additions to the Constitution of the Republic, followed by paragraph 3 of Article 91 of the Constitution, issues of conclusion The Constitutional Council has increased the importance of the institution of constitutional control.

Along with constitutional principles, such as the power of the people and branches of government, the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan always pays attention to the basic principles of a person and his rights, freedoms and life, which are the property of the state. For example, freedom of expression (freedom of speech) is the foundation of pluralism and diversity, the foundation of democracy. Currently, these values are becoming

the object of research on global constitutional control and are limited for reasons of human rights, national security, and public security [20; pp.122-127]. It is believed that the most progressive legal acts - constitutions sometimes lose their significance among the country's criminal laws and lose adequate guarantees of their supremacy. Applying a criminal law that does not comply with the Constitution is the most severe possible infringement on the rights of citizens. Ensuring the supremacy of the Constitution, including the supremacy in the field of criminal law, is very important [21; pp.131-137]. The Constitutional Council will ensure the constitutionality of specific provisions of the Criminal Code, and the direct application of the Constitution forms a positive practice of constitutional legislation by interpreting the basic legal norms of the Constitution. Such an approach to ensuring the supremacy of the Constitution means a guarantee of the inadmissibility of unconstitutional criminal legislation, protects against the existence of provisions that contradict the Constitution and affects the rights and interests of citizens.

In the proceedings on the recognition of unconstitutional Article 47, paragraph 5 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 26, 2011 "On Marriage (Matrimony) and family" on establishing paternity, collecting alimony for the maintenance of a child, collecting funds for the maintenance of a child in the period before childbirth and before the child reaches the age of three, the Constitutional Council of Kazakhstan determined, that the Republic of Kazakhstan is a social state that provides people with a decent life, that it provides a decent life for its citizens. Taking care of children and their upbringing will be the main right and duty of parents, and in the international documents of the mother, before and after the birth of the child in cases where the child must be under special supervision, the recovery of funds for the maintenance of the father of the child to a woman, including an unmarried woman, in connection with her pregnancy and childbirth to a common child, is the implementation of the constitutional provision on the protection of mother and child. The Constitutional Council concluded that the attribution of a woman's right to take care of herself during pregnancy, childbirth and after childbirth, the right to receive money from the father of the child, and the presence or absence of legal marital relations between them is related to the implementation of the state's obligations to protect the institution of the family based on marriage, and protects the institution of the family, which is one of the main values. Paragraph 5 of Article 47 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Marriage (Matrimony) and Family" does not discriminate and does not contradict paragraph 2 of Article 14 and paragraphs 1 and 2 of Article 27 of the Basic Law, since marriage and family, mother and child protection, as well as the constitutional duties of parents, have been defined as values of constitutional significance[22]. The values of the family and the mother and the unborn child were protected, the completeness of the implementation of the constitutional provisions related to them was explained, and systems of constitutional practice

and law enforcement were formed.

In general, the Constitution and its values, rules, and fundamental principles will be the basis of the existence of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In this continuous development, the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in the course of its activities, will ensure the vitality and supremacy of the Constitution, interpret, transform and implement its norms with modern requirements. At the same time, in the process of the influence of international norms and supranational law on national law, it exists as a special body in determining national identity based on the principles and rules that are the basis of statehood. This constitutional peculiarity will ensure the conflict-free development of the constitutional system, the rule of law and the internal harmonization of the Constitution. Constitutional identity is formed by each country with its own special experience, it is not invented or changed by some arbitrary decisions or imposed from the outside. Identity is formed by a combination of historical, social and cultural factors in law. Such an identity is not a frozen situation, it is a dialogical process expressing the beliefs and ideas of each country in the historical past and reinterpreted in each new era [23; p.158]. At the same time, the Constitutional Council will ensure constitutional legality, which is the basic principle of law, protects the Constitution, checks the compliance of laws before they are signed by the President, gives an official interpretation, strengthens constitutional legality and reveals the possibilities of the Constitution by improving the current legislation.

With the decisions of the Constitutional Council on the official interpretation of the norms of the Constitution, the current legislation will rise to a new level without violating the foundations, spirit and institutions of the Constitution. The decisions of the Council occupy a place after the Constitution in the current law of the Republic, increase the possibilities of the current law and become the source of the official constitutional doctrine (constitutional custom), which is the basis of the law-making of the state [24; pp.51-55]. In addition, the Constitutional Council determines the improvement of legislative regulation in certain areas to achieve the goals of strategic plans and the Constitution in the country. They contribute to the democratization of society and the state, ensure the active participation of citizens in the governance of the state, and serve as a body of constitutional justice.

Now the issues of expanding the subjects of appeal and citizens' access to constitutional control are being raised. The Venice Commission of the Council of Europe proposed to single out individual appeals of the parties to the Constitutional Council in the procedural codes, clarify the procedure for judicial review, confirm specific grounds for refusal, and support appeals to higher judicial instances [25]. This will improve the system of citizens' appeals to the constitutional justice system through the court. As a result, during the trial, the parties' petition on the constitutionality of the laws will be specially developed (investigated) by the court and will become an effective mechanism. Citizens'

access to constitutional justice will be fully realized with a qualitative consideration by the court of an indirect appeal to the Constitutional Council through the court. Increasing the effectiveness of this mechanism activates the interests and actions of citizens related to the supremacy of the Constitution. As a result, not only state bodies, but also citizens will be active in strengthening constitutionalism in the state through constitutional justice.

In general, when forming the institution of constitutional control in the country, the Constitutional Council has functional capabilities, including the areas of rule-making, law enforcement, and human rights protection. As a source of law, it has the opportunity to adjust the content of legal acts, actively participate in the constitutionalization of the national legal system, interact with legislative bodies, and have the opportunity to influence the practice of law enforcement by basing general constitutional provisions in the content of its decisions on judicial cases [26; p. 285] are today's features of Kazakhstan's constitutional control.

The Venice Commission of the Council of Europe considers the execution of the final decisions of the constitutional justice bodies as the main indicator of the rule of law. Therefore, the implementation of the decisions of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan will be an indicator of strengthening constitutionalism. At the same time, the interpretation of constitutional norms will contribute to the improvement of constitutional ideas, constitutional culture, knowledge and legal awareness, and constitutional practice. It constitutionalizes all spheres of society and the state, establishes the basic principles of the development of legislation, and develops a legal system based on universally recognized values [27; p.27]. The normative resolutions of the Constitutional Council enrich the current law with the spirit and ideas of the Constitution to further strengthen constitutionalism and ensure its supremacy. As a negative and positive legislator, he does not interfere with the powers of Parliament and other state bodies and acts as carefully as possible.

Results and Discussion

Constitutionalism is a political and legal regime or a multifaceted cumulative concept formed by establishing the supremacy of the Constitution. This is a universal value. In revealing the essence of this idea, maximum harmony and democratic foundations for building political, legal and other relations between the state and the people will be formed. Due to the rule of law or the supremacy of the Constitution, the harmonious development of the state, society and man takes place. In this process, the Constitution, its provisions and its implementation are of particular importance.

In constitutional development based on the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, constitutional principles and values will be accepted by the society based on historical, cultural, and social values (morality) and will be the

core of the development and stability of the state. When state values are adopted in harmony with universal civilizational values, conditions will be created for our country to become an equal member of the international community, and its citizens can enjoy advanced world achievements.

The Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as a body of constitutional justice, ensures the rule of law, supremacy and direct application of the Constitution in constitutional theory and practice within its powers. The synthesis of the doctrine and practice of interpreting the norms of the Constitution, the legal positions of the Constitutional Council will allow the protection and interpret the Basic Law, guide the practice of law enforcement, form a "living" (true) constitutionalism, preserving the constitutional nature of the state structure.

Conclusion

Based on a deep scientific theory, including constitutional and theoretical provisions, will maximize the unity of the letter and spirit of the Constitution, and equal coverage. It is only thanks to high scientific judgments that constitutional norms and rules gain direction and are justified in constitutional practice, application and implementation.

As a body of constitutional justice, the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan ensures constitutional order and security, constitutional traditions, culture, supremacy and direct application of the Constitution, and interpretation of constitutional norms and rules in the development of the state.

Thanks to the activities of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, within its powers, a great contribution is made to the maximum strengthening of the concepts of "rule of law", "rule of law", and "constitutionalism".

References

- Baymakhanova D.M. (2012) "Constitutionalism, its principles and their role in the development and protection of human and civil rights in the Republic of Kazakhstan" // Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan. No. 5, 54-60.
- Sergazinov B.R. (2019) "Theoretical issues of application and interpretation of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan" // Almaty, 350.
- Abdurasulov E.B. (2002) "Interpretation of the law and the norms of the Constitution: theory, experience, the procedure" // Monograph, Almaty: Orkeniyet, 400.
- Nurmaganbetov A. The origins of Kazakh constitutionalism. <https://www.kazpravda.kz/articles/view/istoki-kazahstanskogo-konstitutsionalizma1> (accessed 10 November 2021)
- Shapok U. (2020) "Constitution and the rule of law" // Collection of materials of

- the scientific and practical international conference "Formation and strengthening of professional legal culture of civil servants in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the light of modernization of public consciousness" dedicated to the 25th anniversary of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan – Nur-Sultan: L.N. Gumilev ENU, 373.
<https://www.enu.kz/downloads/oktyabr-2020/1-sent-sbornik.pdf>
- Amrebaev A. Constitutionalism as a choice of the people of Kazakhstan.
https://inbusiness.kz/ru/author_news/konstitucionalizm-kak-vybor-naroda-kazahstana (accessed 10 November 2021)
- Malinovsky V. Values of Kazakhstan constitutionalism. // Thought.
<https://mysl.kazgazeta.kz/news/15466> (accessed 10 October 2021)
- Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan. 30/07/1995.
<https://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K950001000>
- Kotov A. K. (1997) "Sovereign Kazakhstan: citizen, nation, population"// Almaty: Zheti zhargy, 1997, 287.
- The constitutional law of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2001) Studentsbook / resp.editor M. S. Narikbayev. - Almaty: Zheti zhargy, 652.
- Amandykova S.K. (2002) "Formation of the doctrine of constitutionalism in Kazakhstan" // Karaganda, 439.
- Malinovsky V. Values of Kazakhstan constitutionalism. // Thought.
<https://mysl.kazgazeta.kz/news/15466> (accessed 10 October 2021)
- Constitutionalism is the basis of the state independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Malinovsky V.A.; Rogov I.I. Constitutional control in Kazakhstan: the doctrine and practice of the approval of constitutionalism: Monograph/Edited by I.I. Rogov., V.A. Malinovsky. Almaty: Rarity, -2015. page-384.
- Udartsev S.F. (2015) "Phenomenon of legal positions of the constitutional control body" // Current state-legal problems. Issue 3. Collection of materials for the scientific conference. KazGUU. Astana: 126 p., pp.9-15.
- Abdrasulov E.B. "Legal positions and legal principles of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan and their role in the development and improvement of national legislation" // https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=31396694 (accessed December 15, 2021)
- Regulatory Resolution of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 9, 2017 No. 1 on verification of compliance of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Amendments and additions to the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Collection of normative resolutions of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan. – Nur-Sultan, 2019. – 540 p. ISBN 978-601-7800-64-2 <https://ksrk.gov.kz/sites/default/files/books/2020-.pdf> (accessed December 15, 2021)
- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on amendments and additions to the

- Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 10, 2017. No. 51-VI KRZ. <https://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1700000051> (accessed 15 October 2021)
- Regulatory Resolution of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 9, 2017 No. 1 on verification of compliance of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Amendments and Additions to the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan" with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Collection of normative resolutions of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan. – Nur-Sultan, 2019. – 540 p. ISBN 978-601-7800-64-2 <https://ksrk.gov.kz/sites/default/files/books/2020-.pdf> (accessed October 15, 2021)
- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on amendments and additions to the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 10, 2017. No. 51-VI KRZ. <https://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1700000051> (accessed 15 October 2021)
- Zukhtu Arslan. Chairman of the Constitutional Court of Turkey. Freedom of speech, democracy, current issues. Kazakhstan's Way: Constitutionalism, man, peace and prosperity / Collection of articles. Ed. D.yu.n., K.A. Mami–Nur-Sultan, 2020 – page 384. <https://ksrk.gov.kz/sites/default/files/books/2020-09/%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B7.pdf> (accessed 10 December 2021)
- Velchev B. Constitutional foundations of the criminal law of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan's Way: Constitutionalism, man, peace and prosperity / Collection of articles. Ed. and the author of the preface – Doctor of Law, K.A.Mami –Nur-Sultan, 2020 – page 384. <https://ksrk.gov.kz/sites/default/files/books/2020-09/%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B7.pdf> (accessed 20 November 2021)
- Regulatory Resolution of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 10, 2018 No. 3 on the verification of the constitutionality of Article 47, paragraph 5 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Marriage (Matrimony) and Family" on the proposal of the Specialized Interdistrict Juvenile Court of the Karaganda region.
- Zorkin V. (2020) "Constitutional identity in the conjugation of the national and interstate legal order. Kazakhstan's Way: Constitutionalism, man, peace and prosperity" // Collection of articles. Ed. and the author of the preface, Doctor of Law, Professor K.A. Mami–Nur-Sultan, 2020 – 384 p. (accessed 20 November 2021)
- Kogamov M.Ch. (2015) "Constitutional Council: formation of the doctrine and practice of constitutional legality. Constitutional control in Kazakhstan: the doctrine and practice of the approval of constitutionalism" // Monograph/Edited by I.I. Rogov. , V.A. Malinovsky. Almaty: Rarity, 384.
- Message of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the state of constitutional law in the Republic of Kazakhstan" (published on June 21,

2021, at a joint meeting of the Chambers of the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan) Message of the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 21, 2021

Ostapovich I.Y. (2020) "Kazakhstan's way: constitutionalism, man, peace and prosperity" // Collection of articles. Ed. and the author of the preface, Doctor of Law, Professor K.A. Mami–Nur-Sultan, 384.

Mami K.A. Constitutional control in the modern world: the experience of Kazakhstan. Constitutional Studies, Volume I. 2019 Constitutional Court of the Republic of Bulgaria. . 27-p.
<https://ksrk.gov.kz/sites/default/files/books/2021-06/Constitutional%20Studies%20-%20Volume%20one.pdf> (accessed 20 November 2021)

Certificate of Submitting

This certificate confirms the fact that the article «Legal regulation of climate change in the context of global warming», authored by Gulnar Aigarinova, Nuradin Nakyshov, Turdaly Karatayev, Gylshat Rakhmetova, Sadykh Yessimkulov was submitted for publication in Scopus journals with percentile 50 and higher.

Date: 24.01.2023

Head of Scientific Projects
Implementation Department,
Tatyana Volynets



Certificate of Submitting

This certificate confirms the fact that the article «Problems of legal provision of sanitary and epidemiological safety of the population in the context of modern challenges», authored by Gulnar Aigarinova, Maksat Yelikbai, Saltanat Beisebaeva, Auyelkhan Sabirov, Adema Suttibayeva was submitted for publication in Scopus journals with percentile 50 and higher.

Date: 24.01.2023

Head of Scientific Projects
Implementation Department,
Tatyana Volynets



ISSN 1563-0366; eISSN 2617-8362

ӘЛ-ФАРАБИ атындағы ҚАЗАҚ ҰЛТТЫҚ УНИВЕРСИТЕТІ

ХАБАРШЫ

Заң сериясы

КАЗАХСКИЙ НАЦИОНАЛЬНЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ имени АЛЬ-ФАРАБИ

ВЕСТНИК

Серия юридическая

AL-FARABI KAZAKH NATIONAL UNIVERSITY

JOURNAL

of Actual Problems of Jurisprudence

№4 (104)

Алматы
«Қазак университеті»
2022



ХАБАРШЫ

ЗАҢ СЕРИЯСЫ № 4 (104) желтоқсан

ISSN 1563-0366, eISSN 2617-8362



04.05.2017 ж. Қазақстан Республикасының Ақпарат және коммуникация министрлігінде тіркелген

Қуәлік № 16496-Ж

*Журнал жылына 4 рет жарыққа шығады
(наурыз, маусым, қыркүйек, желтоқсан)*

ЖАУАПТЫ ХАТШЫ

Сманова А.Б., з.ғ.к., доцент (Қазақстан)
Телефон: +7727-377-33-36 (ішкі в. 12-57)
E-mail: Akmaral.Smanova@kaznu.kz

РЕДАКЦИЯ АЛҚАСЫ:

Байдельдинов Д.Т., з.ғ.д., профессор
(бас редактор) (Қазақстан)
Алимкулов Е.Т., з.ғ.к., доцент м.а. (бас редактордың
орынбасары) (Қазақстан)
Кеижалиев З.Ж., з.ғ.д., профессор (Қазақстан)
Джансарова Р.Р., з.ғ.д., профессор (Қазақстан)
Тыныбеков С.Т., з.ғ.д., профессор (Қазақстан)
Ибраева А.С., з.ғ.д., профессор (Қазақстан)
Жатқанбаева А.Е., з.ғ.д., профессор (Қазақстан)
Маликова Ш.Б., з.ғ.к., доцент м.а. (Қазақстан)
Қабанбаева Г.Б., PhD докторы, доцент (Қазақстан)

Муксимова А.Т., (Қазақстан)
Абикенов А.А., з.ғ.к. (Қазақстан)
Томас Хоффман, PhD докторы, профессор (Эстония)
Шелухин С.И., PhD, профессор (АҚШ)
Ганс Йохим Шрам, құқық докторы, профессор
(Германия)
Алиев А.И., з.ғ.д., профессор (Әзірбайжан)
Репецкая А.Л., з.ғ.д., профессор (Хакасия)

ТЕХНИКАЛЫҚ ХАТШЫ

Махамбетсалиев Д.Б., магистрант (Қазақстан)

Заң сериясы Мемлекет пен құқық теориясы және тарихы, конституциялық және әкімшілік құқығы, азаматтық құқық және еңбек құқығы, табиғи ресурстар және экологиялық құқық, қылмыстық құқық және криминалистика, халықаралық қатынастар бағыттарын қамтиды.



Жоба менеджері
Гульмира Шакқозова
Телефон: +7 701 724 2911
E-mail: Gulmira.Shakkozova@kaznu.kz

Компьютерде беттеген
Ұлжан Молдашева

ИБ № 14878

Пішімі 60x84/8. Көлемі 11,3 б.т. Тапсырыс № 7.
Әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университетінің
«Қазақ университеті» баспа үйі.
050040, Алматы қаласы, әл-Фараби даңғылы, 71.
«Қазақ университеті» баспа үйінің баспаханасында
басылды.

© Әл-Фараби атындағы ҚазҰУ, 2022

A.T. Ozenbayeva^{1*}, D.N. Bekezhanov², D. Nurmukhankyzy²,
L.B. Alimbek¹, A.A. Suttibayeva³

¹Central-Asian Innovation University, Kazakhstan, Shymkent

²Zhetysu University named after I. Zhansugurov, Kazakhstan, Taldykorgan

³Mukhtar Auezov South Kazakhstan University, Kazakhstan, Shymkent

*e-mail: oaikoshat@mail.ru

CURRENT THEORETICAL ISSUES OF ECOLOGICAL LEGAL ORDER IN THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN

This article discusses current theoretical issues of ecological legal order in the RK. The authors claims that the rule of law is a particularly effective mechanism for increasing the level of environmental awareness of citizens, forcing nature users to comply with the established level of ecological legal order. The scientific novelty of this study is determined by the fact that the paper clarifies and details certain understudied aspects of the concept "ecological legal order", and also considers ecological legal order as the main ecological and legal institution. The article analyzes that legal order of rational nature management is established under the influence of legislative and other requirements of environmental law. The authors also note that ecological legal order is established on the basis of legal liability. The general trend in developing ecological legal order is to increase social significance of environmental legislation, further modernization of material norms and improving protective forms of their implementation. The purpose of the work is to create a general theoretical and practical concept of ecological legal order in modern Kazakhstan. The authors sets the task to determine the ecological legal order, analyze its place in the field of law, consider the relationship of environmental law and legal responsibility, determine the relationship of environmental legal awareness, education, culture and law and order. The preparation of the work required analysis of prominent research papers, which significantly contributed to development of environmental and legal science.

Key words: ecological legal order, environmental law, legal awareness, norm, environmental legislation, legal relations, law, responsibility.

A.T. Озенбаева^{1*}, Д.Н. Бекежанов², Д. Нұрмұханқызы², Л.Б. Алимбек¹, А.А. Суттибаева³

¹Орталық Азия инновациялық университеті, Қазақстан, Шымкент қ.

²Жансүгіров атындағы Жетісу университеті, Қазақстан, Талдықорған қ.

³Мұхтар Әуезов атындағы Оңтүстік Қазақстан университеті, Қазақстан, Шымкент қ.

* e-mail: oaikoshat@mail.ru

Қазақстан Республикасындағы экологиялық құқық тәртібінің өзекті теориялық мәселелері

Бұл мақалада Қазақстан Республикасындағы экологиялық құқықтық тәртіптің өзекті теориялық мәселелері қарастырылған. Авторлар заңның үстемдігі азаматтардың экологиялық құқықтық сана деңгейін арттырудың, табиғи ресурстарды пайдаланушыларды экологиялық құқықтық тәртіптің белгіленген межесін сақтауға мәжбүрлеудің ерекше тиімді тетігі екенін атап өтеді. Зерттеудің ғылыми жаңалығы жұмыста «экологиялық құқық тәртібі» түсінігінің кейбір аз зерттелген аспектілері нақтыланып, егжей-тегжейлі зерттеумен, сонымен қатар экологиялық құқық тәртібінің негізгі экологиялық құқықтың институты ретінде қарастырылуымен айқындайды. Табиғатты ұтымды пайдаланудың бұл тәртібі экологиялық құқықтың заңнамалық және басқа да талаптарының әсерінен қалыптасатындығы талданды. Сондай-ақ авторлар экологиялық құқықтық тәртіп заңды жауапкершілік негізінде белгіленетінін атап көрсеткен. Экологиялық құқық тәртібін дамытудың жалпы тенденциясы – табиғатты қорғау заңнамасының әлеуметтік маңызын арттыру, материалдық нормаларды одан әрі жаңғырту және оларды жүзеге асырудың қорғау нысандарын жетілдіру. Жұмыстың мақсаты – қазіргі Қазақстандағы экологиялық құқықтық тәртіптің жалпы теориялық және практикалық тұжырымдамасын жасау. Авторлар экологиялық құқықтық тәртіпті анықтау, оның құқық саласындағы орнын талдау, экологиялық құқықтық тәртіп пен құқықтық жауапкершілік арасындағы байланысты қарастыру, экологиялық құқықтық санының, тәрбиенің, мәдениеттің және құқықтық тәртіптің байланысын анықтау міндетін қойды. Жұмысты дайындауда ғалымдардың еңбектері пайдаланылды, бұл экология және заң ғылымының дамуына зор үлес қосады.

Түйін сөзгер: экологиялық құқық тәртібі, экологиялық құқық, құқықтық сана, норма, экологиялық заңнама, құқықтық қатынастар, құқық, жауапкершілік

А.Т. Озенбаева^{1*}, Д.Н. Бекежанов², Д. Нұрмуханқызы², А.Б. Алимбек¹, А.А. Суттибаева³

¹Центрально-Азиатский инновационный университет, Казахстан, г. Шымкент

²Жетысуский университет имени И. Жансугурова, Казахстан, г. Талдыкорган

³Южно-Казахстанский университет имени Мухтара Ауэзова, Казахстан, г. Шымкент

*e-mail: oaikoshat@mail.ru

Актуальные теоретические вопросы экологического правопорядка в Республике Казахстан

В данной статье рассматриваются актуальные теоретические вопросы экологического правопорядка в Республике Казахстан. Авторы отмечают, что правопорядок является особо действенным механизмом повышения уровня экологического правосознания граждан, понуждающим природопользователей к соблюдению установленного уровня экологического правопорядка. Научная новизна данного исследования определяется тем, что в работе уточняются и детализируются отдельные малоизученные аспекты понятия «экологический правопорядок», а также рассматривается экологический правопорядок как основной эколого-правовой институт. Проанализировано, что данный порядок рационального природопользования формируется под влиянием законодательных и иных требований экологического права. Авторы также отмечают, что экологический правопорядок устанавливается на основе юридической ответственности. Общая тенденция развития экологического правопорядка заключается в повышении социальной значимости природоохранного законодательства, дальнейшей модернизации материальных норм и совершенствовании охранных форм их реализации. Цель исследования – создание общей теоретико-практической концепции экологического правопорядка в современном Казахстане. Авторами поставлена задача определить экологический правопорядок, проанализировать его место в сфере права, рассмотреть соотношение экологического правопорядка и юридической ответственности, определить взаимосвязь экологического правосознания, образования, культуры и правопорядка. При подготовке работы были использованы труды ученых, значительный вклад в развитие эколого-правовой науки.

Ключевые слова: экологический правопорядок, экологическое право, правосознание, норма, экологическое законодательство, правоотношения, закон, ответственность.

Introduction

Along with rapid development of production, environmental situation is currently deteriorating all over the world. There are many reasons for this. For example, growth of harmful emissions and waste from industrial enterprises, their failure to comply with technical, environmental and sanitary requirements, lack of interest from our domestic entrepreneurs in producing environmentally friendly products, exhaustion of natural resources, low level of environmental awareness among people, lack of concern for the health of future generations, etc.

It should also be noted that climate change caused by “warming effect” is one of the global problems. In addition, negative attitude of people to environment poses the greatest potential threat here. Taking into account that shaping legal awareness by entering into environmental legal relations without harming nature is one of the most important conditions in human life, let us emphasize the issue of improper environmental law enforcement and lack of proper environmental awareness.

Solving environmental problems requires a comprehensive approach, they cannot be partially solved. Measurement and assessment of life quality include various aspects that need support from legal system and environmental conservation policy (Krisnandar 2022: 616).

In recent years, we have seen that “ecological legal order” has evolved into a normative legal acting system of regulations, including rules, guidelines, requirements, policies, and case law and administrative interpretations related to a wide range of environmental issues and problems.

Harmonious relations between man and nature require development everywhere under the influence of legal, educational, and economic mechanisms, which encourage rational and careful treatment of nature, its resources, and ecological systems everywhere.

Environmental protection programs and laws are useless as long as victims of pollution are denied participation in the process of law implementation. Wider public participation can be of great importance in solving problems of environmental management. Nevertheless, dissemination of information is

crucial for creating opportunities for such participation (<https://doi.org/10.1177/0975425314521547>).

Law is a particularly effective mechanism for increasing the level of environmental awareness among citizens, forcing nature users to comply with the established level of ecological legal order. This order of rational use of nature is formed under the influence of legislative and other requirements of environmental law, which are currently being developed and improved within the framework of international environmental law norms.

As for the issue of ecological legal order, the problem of exercising individual environmental rights is much broader and includes areas, which, at first glance, do not have a direct relationship to it. In the context of global environmental crisis, not only human rights to a favorable environment are under threat, but also other rights, primarily the right to life, can be targeted. Any ecological catastrophe can eventually lead to the loss of meaning of other human rights along with environmental.

Experience of nature management has revealed many systemic and local shortcomings in the procedures and rules, established by the current legislation. Many attempts to improve individual controls are not enough to improve the entire system. The remaining elements of authoritarian ideology, supplemented by detailed procedures, complicated and bureaucratized the management system.

Environmental legislation acts as the most effective means of educating citizens at the level of ecological and legal consciousness, forcing nature users to comply with ecological legal order, established by a legal act. We notice that the rule of law occupies a special place in the system of legal categories that ensure the rational and efficient use of natural resources and the protection of the environment. However, the concept was studied only within common law theory, leaving behind any relations to other branches of law. Ecological legal order is still applied only as a legal definition, approved in some regulatory legal acts. Therefore, ecological legal order is one of the urgent issues of environmental law studies and requires conceptual development of its theoretical issues.

Materials and methods

Comparative and legal, formal and logical, systemic, real and social methods are research methods used in the article. The methodological basis of the study includes the norms set forth in theoretical papers in the field of environmental policy theory,

environmental law, state and law, directly related to ecological legal order, constitute

Systematic approach to determining the system-structural characteristics of legality and law and order in the field of environmental law has proved to be very effective. From its point of view, the rule of law in our society is considered as a complexly organized, internally differentiated whole, and its system components are the rule of law in various spheres of society.

Research papers of law scholars, who study various branches and sciences of law and belong to various directions and schools, as well as materials published in the periodical press, serve as the theoretical foundation to substantiate the provisions highlighted in the paper. The scientific foundation is the number of research papers by Kazakhstani, Russian and foreign scholars, who specialize in environmental, land, natural resource law: Erkinbaeva L.K., Bajdel'dinov D.L., Bekisheva S.D., Bogoljubov S.A., Gerasimov V.S., Rashhupkina L.V., Gupta N., Iis K., Taty S., Endang S., Iis I. N., Isakova Ju.I., Meng-Meng Geng, Ling-Yun He, Muhina I.D., Storm P., Saheb S. U., Sepuri S., Buddolla V and Vlasova Yu.V. и.д.

Results and discussion

In legal science, ecological legal order is currently understood as a sphere of interaction between society and nature, based on legal norms that ensure citizens' lives in a safe environment.

Social and environmental responsibility, commonly known as corporate social responsibility, has different dimensions (Rosa-Jiménez & Nebot, 2021). It is necessary to take into account the law and moral burden, initially striving for economic attractiveness, since the beginning of business activity can turn into attraction of law energy and morality of business entities (Mazzone 2021). This condition reveals that these provisions of the law must be consistently applied, even though the facts prove that the problem of law enforcement in the country is a serious problem, requiring in-depth study, since law enforcement includes many components (Sutrisno 2019).

As a legal phenomenon, ecological legal order can be shaped only on the basis of law, that is on the basis of norms (rules of conduct) expressing the will of the state in normative acts (laws and by-laws).

The category of "ecological legal order" is understudied and rarely used in modern environmental law, as well as in other branches of modern law. At

the same time, it has important theoretical and practical significance for further establishment and improvement of environmental legislation and practice of its implementation (http://teoria-practica.ru/rus/files/arhiv_zhurnala/2015/9/law/mukhina.pdf).

The concept of environmental law and order is substantiated, firstly, by the need to determine the state of environmental legislation at the present stage of its development, secondly, by determining the directions for further development of legal regulation of environmental legal relations in the RK, and thirdly, monitoring implementation of environmental legislation in the country. Ecological legal order is a system that is based on legal norms and public ecological and legal relations (Vlassova 2019: 176).

Ecological legal order, which is understood as a set of rules and institutions that serve to protect, maintain and develop natural foundations of human life, focused on sustainability and standardization of environmental protection. This is more than peripheral short-term environmental protection, which is carried out individually to prevent risks; rather, it means comprehensive, comprehensive and long-term protection in accordance with ongoing responsibility we bear for the world around us, for the world we share with others, and for the world of future generations (<https://www.iuscomp.org/gla/literature/envirmt.htm>).

Ecological legal order is a state of inter-subject relations within subject-object system relations in the sphere of interaction between society and nature. It is designed to ensure legal capacity of environment and carried out in accordance with the norms established by legal acts (<https://www.dissercat.com/content/ekologicheskii-pravoporyadok-obshcheteoreticheskii-analiz>).

The provision of ecological legal order is understood as the legal regulation of public relations in the field of nature protection, sub-normative regulation, their protection and control, as well as other activities, contributing to establishment of environmental protection and development of law and order.

The mechanism for ensuring ecological legal order is proposed as a system of subjects, using a set of legal instruments within the framework of technologies for legal regulation of interaction between society and nature.

Legal behavior of environmental subjects is formed in different ways. These are forms of environmental and ecological-legal education and training, shaping legal behavior of subjects of environmental relations and other positive incentives aimed

at developing ecological culture, ecological and legal consciousness, responsibility for prevention of environmental offenses (<https://lawbook.online/ekologicheskoe-pravo-rossii-kniga/ekologicheskii-pravoporyadok-sposobyi-ego-68141.html>).

The main goal of law and order in the field of environmental protection is based on legal norms, public ecological and legal relations, harmony between human development and favorable environmental conditions.

As a legal phenomenon, the ecological legal order is organized on the basis of state and legal norms that preserve the environment suitable for the members of Kazakhstani society and the ecological safety of future generations. Environmental legal order does not exist and cannot exist without these legal norms. They are the main foundation of the environmental legal order.

The rules of procedure (norms) established in environmental legislation are “paper” rules. They acquire their authenticity and “live” in behavior and actions of subjects of ecological legal order. Over the years of independence, our country has adopted several legal acts in order to regulate ecological legal order. In order to regulate environmental law, including legal order on January 2, 2021, the new Environmental Code of the RK was adopted (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K2100000400>).

Since ecological ecological legal order is implemented and established under the guidance of legal norms mentioned above, legal norms have to be described and assessed in general.

Ecological legal order is based on normative and constitutional foundations of legal system, which includes two levels of legislation – basic principles and norms of international law and legislation of the RK. In this regard, two types of ecological legal order should be distinguished – international and national.

International ecological legal order is formed as a result of commitment of the world community to generally recognized principles and norms enshrined in international legal documents on environmental protection and rational use of environment in the interests of present and future generations. National ecological legal order is based on application of norms throughout the territory of the RK.

In particular, issues such as correlation of legal status of land, water, forest, and other natural objects as a part of nature, environment and, at the same time, the object of property turnover remain unexplored. It is important to have clear regulations to determine the balance of environmental and legal priorities (Bogolyubov 2011: 5).

Considering the civil law type of liability for environmental offenses in domestic science, in our opinion, current procedure works properly in bringing civil liability, claims for misuse of recovered funds for causing damage to environment, claims for incomplete satisfaction. Imperfect calculation methodology for determining the amount of damage caused does not ensure effectiveness of this liability. Therefore, we consider it important to take into account distinction between administrative and criminal liability (Baideldinov 2004: 29).

In recent decades, legal science has been actively exploring the criteria for determining legal liability, authors have developed new ones, supplemented the existing theoretical constructions of legal liability model. Classification of liabilities for environmental offenses is quite different. In addition, there is currently no single way to solve the problem of limiting types of liability.

Environmental responsibility is an environmental protection tool aimed at preventing and compensating for environmental damage. This helps to increase the personal responsibility of (economic) players. A well-developed law on environmental responsibility creates economic incentives to prevent damage, freeing the way for the polluter to pay compensation for any damage caused.

The legislative body can adopt legislation on environmental responsibility both within the framework of public and civil law. In civil law, we are talking about compensation for damage to the life, health or property of persons who have become victims of such damage, mediated by environmental means, as a result of the actions of other persons.

Responsibility for harming the environment as a common good – for example, biodiversity, water and soil – can strengthen preventive environmental protection and provide compulsory compensation for environmental damage in accordance with the principle of “the polluter pays”.

Legal sources suggest customary division of legal liability into branches such as criminal, administrative, civil, disciplinary, property. According to the above classification, legal liability is characterized by such elements as grounds for liability, subjects, conditions, liability measures, procedures for liability application.

At this stage, administrative responsibility for environment, law and order and environmental protection are of great importance.

The administrative impact and wide scope of offenses, harming the environment (compared to the

Criminal Code of the RK), show that prevention of new offenses is quite significant.

If environmental offenses cause great harm to the environment, they are qualified as criminal offenses. A system of norms representing liability for violations in actual social relations has been established in Kazakhstani society. This is the application of administrative and legal sanctions of environmental legislation to violators of legal liability.

The list of application of administrative liability for environmental offenses was approved by Chapter 21 of the Administrative Code of the RK “Administrative offenses in the field of environmental protection and nature management” (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1400000235>)

Administrative liability is provided for administrative environmental offenses in the event of harm to the environmental order established in the RK, public health and environmental safety, environment, or harm caused as a result of inaction.

Citizens, officials and legal entities who violate administrative and legal norms bear administrative responsibility for violating environmental legislation, including causing harm to the environment or threat of harming it.

There are many environmental norms in criminal law. The norms of criminal law are an integral part of environmental law without ceasing to be a criminal law. Along with it, they are the subject of regulation and partly a method of regulation.

Offenses are commonly divided into crimes and other offenses according to the degree of public danger. The current Criminal Code introduces the category of environmental offense, summarized in Chapter 13 “Environmental criminal violation” ([https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1400000226/k226_](https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1400000226_k226_)).

Environmental criminal offenses are distinguished from other offenses by the degree of public danger. The Criminal Law clearly defines the range of actions which are criminally punishable offenses.

Liability for environmental offenses has a number of basic functions:

- incentives encouraging compliance with environmental standards;
- compensation, which focuses on compensating for damage to the environment and human health;
- preventive, stop new offenses from happening;
- punisher, he punishes a person who violates the environmental law.

The main task of liability is to support establishment of law and order in the field of environ-

mental protection. The ecological legal order, which includes these components (elements, institutions), requires guarantees of its sustainable functioning and strengthening. One of such guarantees is legal liability of ecological legal order subjects.

Requirements of ecological legal order are implemented through decisions and actions of subjects of ecological legal order in an orderly system of environmental legal relations, as proved above. In order for ecological legal order to reach the quality established by law, it should be shaped only by legal actions and actions of environmental law subjects. This is possible only if these subjects themselves have a certain ecological sense of justice.

When a new branch of law is born, process of its introduction takes place. Apart from this, the question of its name always arises, which should be derived from the nature of public relations regulated by the branch. In order to understand true nature and patterns of ecological legal order, we have to analyze development of phenomenon, historical sources and official documents, which allow us to assess emergence and dynamics of solving environmental problems, understand its modernity, environmental law in the general legal system, causes, consequences, scope of human activities in the field of pollution and environmental protection.

The norms of environmental law as well as ecological culture and ecological legal awareness are crucial in ensuring ecological legal order.

Due to the diversity of ecological law norms, it will not be possible to create a system of complex control, preservation and prevention of violations only by the efforts of state bodies, local self-government bodies and public organizations. Often compensating for ecological violations, they do not eliminate irreversible changes in the natural environment. Therefore, it is fundamentally important to form a conscious legal behavior in the sphere of interaction with the environment. Such a level of general ecological and legal awareness is necessary so that all subjects of environmental legal relations voluntarily and consciously fulfill the requirements of environmental legal norms. The system of ecological education and information can solve this problem.

Although environmental legal awareness of civil society members is at a high level, effectively functioning ecological legal order cannot be established independently. Ecological legal order can be ensured through consistent implementation of the system of scientifically sound legal, organizational, economic, technical, educational and other mea-

asures for ecological protection and rational use of natural resources. The question remains open as to which legal instruments constitute the essence of legal mechanism for ensuring ecological legal order (Gerasimov 2006: 25).

Educational activities in any forms are considered as measures to improve ecological culture. It is necessary to add special norms to the new Environmental code as the basis for shaping environmental culture through organization of environmental education, teaching foundations of environmental education in educational institutions, environmental training of managers and specialists, ecological education.

Ecological education is an important component of environmental culture. Ecological education is a way of influencing people's consciousness through a system of knowledge, skills and abilities in the field of relations between society and nature. In addition, these should be natural law knowledge and skills (Isakova 2017: 297).

Teaching foundations of ecological education regardless of the nature and organizational and legal forms in all preschool educational organizations, secondary education institutions and organizations of additional training, as well as taking into account specialization of educational organizations studying environmental protection, environmental safety and rational use of natural objects. In addition, to general environmental education, teaching foundations of environmental law as a part of environmental and legal training is to be implemented at universities, educational institutions that train ecologists and specialists in the field of environmental protection and nature management.

Legal behavior of subjects of environmental relations is stimulated by using moral and material incentives through providing benefits.

These measures are state (used by state bodies of the RK and subjects of the RK), local authorities, public (used by public associations), local (used by subjects of environmental relations).

Ecological moral support includes incentive measures provided by labor legislation, awarding of honorary titles, state awards, honorary certificates, etc.

Ecological material incentives include bonuses for employees of enterprises and other organizations provided by remuneration system, awarding them with valuable gifts, payment of one-time bonuses from public associations, state bodies, and local authorities.

It is worth considering whether governmental policy in the field of ecological regulation can meet

the requirements of residents to the environment quality and benefit people. The subjective assessment of public opinion can more intuitively show whether state environmental regulation has brought "environmental benefits for people". The study showed that environmental regulation has a significant positive impact on satisfaction with environmental management, while environmental awareness has a significant negative impact on satisfaction with environmental management. We also found out that when public environmental awareness is taken into account, it affects positive relationship between environmental regulation and satisfaction with environmental management (<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>)

Ecological consciousness must be shaped in order to create an ideal society. The dictionary meaning of the word "environment" is surrounding objects, region or circumstances, and the phrase "environmental awareness" will mean that a person must be aware of his environment so that this environment is not abused. Recently, this connection of environment with human life has developed into an independent research area, called environmental sciences. According to the literature, interaction of man and environment dates back to the most remote times in the history of mankind. Sometimes this is perceived as the struggle between them. There were also times when these relationships took the form of respectable coexistence. While the history of mankind over the past few millennia has been known for its constant and/or consistent progress in various spheres of life, mysteries of nature have often proved very tempting for human thinking and actions to solve. The key theme of which is that natural balance between human life and environment should not be lost. This is the basic requirement for life, especially human, to thrive (Syed Ussain Saheb et al. 2012).

Consequently, efforts are being made to develop environmental consciousness or awareness among masses. It is education that can make a person conscious and aware of environment and ecological issues. Existing principles, acts, case law, regulations, norms, etc. already constitute an extensive and complex apparatus of documents and duties assigned to certain bodies or persons.

However, if we take into account that the existing law also seems to be completely inadequate to this problem and that much more may be needed, the question arises as to how much resources, wealth, energy and intelligence India should spend on this task of regulation and control. Pollution re-

sulting from excessive complexity and a huge number of laws, regulations and officials is by no means the least of the threats to our habitat. Another cause for concern is the need to ensure sufficient flexibility of laws and regulations in this area and their openness to change direction when it is necessary. Good environmental laws are based or should be based on lessons that can be learned from natural sciences and technology (<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>).

Public awareness of environmental laws plays a vital role in prevention and control of pollution at both industrial and public levels. Moreover, awareness is necessary for taking action.

Conclusion

Having studied the theoretical issues of ecological legal order, we came to the following conclusions.

Ecological legal order is a systemic phenomenon that has an external and internal structure. Ecological legal order is considered as an element of higher law and order in society as a whole. Connections with other legal systems (economic, social, political) form an external structure. Therefore, ecological order should be considered as an institution of environmental law.

Legal liability is one of the important structural elements of legal support for environmental law. Its essence lies in negative consequences for a violator of environmental requirements. State enforcement of environmental requirements is carried out through the application of legal liability. The main task of responsibility is to support establishment of law and order in the field of environmental protection. Ecological legal order, which includes these components (elements, institutions), requires guarantees of its sustainable functioning and strengthening. One of such guarantees is the legal responsibility of the subjects of ecological legal order.

Ecological legal order consists in increasing social significance of environmental legislation, further modernization of material norms and improving safe forms of their implementation. Environmental, criminal, administrative, civil, civil proceedings and other branches of law and legislation, nature protection, land and other natural resources represent a combination of public and private methods of regulation.

We need a high level of environmental legal awareness, in which all subjects of environmental legal relations voluntarily and consciously comply

with the requirements of environmental legal norms. Ecological consciousness must be shaped in order to create an ideal society.

In order for ecological legal order to reach the quality established by law, it should be formed only by legal actions and actions of environmental law subjects. This is possible only if these subjects themselves have a certain ecological sense of justice.

All forms of education serve as measures to increase ecological culture. It is necessary to add special norms to the new environmental code as a basis for the formation of environmental culture through the organization of environmental education, teaching the basics of environmental education in educational institutions, environmental training of managers and specialists, and environmental education.

Teaching foundations of environmental education should be introduced regardless of nature and

organizational and legal forms in all preschool educational organizations, general education institutions and organizations of additional education, as well as taking into account the nature of educational organizations studying environmental protection, environmental safety and rational use of natural objects. In addition, to general environmental education, environmental and legal education, consisting in teaching foundations of environmental law, is to be implemented at universities, educational institutions that train ecologists and specialists in the field of environmental protection and nature management.

The article was prepared within the framework of grant project of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the RK No. AP14872548 "Modern ecological legal order: case of Kazakhstan".

Литература

- Байдельдинов Д.Л., Бекишева С.Д. Экологическое право Республики Казахстан: Учебное пособие. – Алматы: Издательский центр ОФППИ «Интерлигал», 2004. – С. 175-176.
- Боголюбов С.А. Право и единая государственная экологическая политика // Журнал российского права. – 2011. – № 3. – С. 5-8.
- Власова Ю.В. (2019) Экологический правопорядок: понятие и способы защиты // Международный журнал гуманитарных и естественных наук. – Том. 3-2. – С. 176-179.
- Герасимов В.С., Ращупкина Л.В. (2006) Правовые средства обеспечения экологического правопорядка: Учеб. пособие / Владим. гос. ун-т. – Владимир: Изд-во Владим. гос. ун-та, – 176 с.
- Gupta N. (2014) Environmental Awareness Policies and its Effectiveness: A Study of Ludhiana City (India). *Environment and Urbanization ASIA*. – 5(1). – Pp. 147-160. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0975425314521547>
- Еркинбаева Л.К. Экономические инструменты охраны окружающей среды и проблемы их реализации в экологическом законодательстве Республики Казахстан: проблемы теории и практики // Вестник КазНУ. Серия Юридическая. – Vol. 58, № 2. – 2016 // <https://bulletin-law.kaznu.kz/index.php/journal/article/view/300>
- Исакова Ю.И. Формирование экологического правосознания // Россия в современном мире: политико-правовой аспект. Сборник научных трудов ИИИ Международной научной конференции. – Ростов н/д., 2017. – С. 297-301.
- Iis Krisnandar, Taty Sugiarty, Endang Sutrisno, Iis Isnaeni Nurwanty (2022) Law awareness and law compliance of business actors in the iso 26000 perspective based on sustainable development. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*. – Vol. 6, No. 5. – Pp. 616-622.
- Mazzone A., Yanagida T., Camodeca M., & Strohmeier D. (2021). Information processing of social exclusion: Links with bullying, moral disengagement and guilt // *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology*. – Vol. 75 (May), 101292. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.appdev.2021.101292>
- Meng-Meng Geng, Ling-Yun He (2021) Environmental Regulation, Environmental Awareness and Environmental Governance Satisfaction Sustainability. – Vol. 13. 3960 <https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>
- Мухина И.Д. Экологический правопорядок: проблемы содержания // http://teoria-practica.ru/rus/files/arhiv_zhurnala/2015/9/law/mukhina.pdf
- Об административных правонарушениях Кодекс Республики Казахстан от 5 июля 2014 года № 235-В ЗПК. [хттпс://адилет.зан.кз/рус/доц/K1400000235](https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/doc/K1400000235)
- Peter-Christoph Storm (2000) Environmental Laws: Introduction. *Wangen im Allgäu* // <https://www.iuscomp.org/gla/literature/envirmt.htm>
- Ращупкина Л.В. Экологический правопорядок: Общетеоретический анализ: Автореф. дисс. кандидата юрид. наук. – Владимир, 2006 // <https://www.dissercat.com/content/ekologicheskii-pravoporyadok-obshcheteoreticheskii-analiz>
- Rosa-Jiménez C., Nebot, N. (2021). Economic viability of neighborhood cooperatives for active aging. Malaga as a case study. *Viabilidad económica de las cooperativas vecinales para el envejecimiento activo. Málaga como caso de estudio. Architecture, City and Environment*. – Vol. 15(45). – Pp. 1-13.
- Sutrisno E. (2019). *Pemaknaan Budaya Hukum: Menggagas Kesejahteraan Masyarakat*. Bogor: In-Media

Syed Ussain Saheb, Sepuri Sessaiah and Buddolla Viswanath (2012) Environment and Their Legal Issues in India// International Research Journal of Environment Sciences. – Vol. 1(3). – Pp. 44-51.

Стеблов А.Л., Вайсман Я.И. (2010) Экологическое право Российской Федерации и стран Европейского сообщества: Учебное пособие. – Пермь, 2010 <https://lawbook.online/ekologicheskoe-pravo-rossii-kniga/ekologicheskii-pravoporyadok-sposobyi-ego-68141.html>

Уголовный кодекс Республики Казахстан от 3 июля 2014 года № 226-V ЗПК // <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1400000226>

Экологический кодекс Республики Казахстан от 2 января 2021 года // <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K2100000400>

References

Bajdel'dinov D.L., Bekisheva S.D. (2004) Jekologicheskoe pravo Respubliki Kazahstan [Ecological law of the RK]: Uchebnoe posobie. – Almaty: Izdatel'skij centr OFPPI «Interligab». – S. 175-176.

Bogoljubov S.A. (2011) Pravo i edinaja gosudarstvennaja jekologicheskaja politika [Law and unified state environmental policy] Zhurnal rossijskogo prava. – № 3. – С. 5-8.

Erkinbaeva L. K. Jekonomicheskie instrumenty ohrany okruzhajushhej sredy i problemy ih realizacii v jekologicheskom zakonodatel'stve Respubliki Kazahstan: problemy teorii i praktiki. [Economic instruments of environmental protection and problems of their implementation in ecological legislation of the RK: problems of theory and practice]. Vestnik KazNU. Serija Juridicheskaja, vol. 58, no. 2, 2016. <https://bulletin-law.kaznu.kz/index.php/journal/article/view/300>

Gerasimov V.S., Rashhupkina L.V. (2006) Pravovye sredstva obespechenija jekologicheskogo pravoporjadka [Legal means of ensuring ecological legal order]. Ucheb. Posobie. Vladim. gos. un-t. – Vladimir : Izd-vo Vladim. gos. un-ta, – 176 s.

Gupta N. (2014) Environmental Awareness Policies and its Effectiveness: A Study of Ludhiana City (India). Environment and Urbanization ASIA, 5(1), pp. 147-160. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0975425314521547>

Iis Krisnandar, Taty Sugiarty, Endang Sutrisno, Iis Isnaeni Nurwanty (2022) Law awareness and law compliance of business actors in the iso 26000 perspective based on sustainable development. Journal of Positive School Psychology, Vol. 6, No. 5, pp. 616-622.

Isakova Ju.I. (2017) Formirovanie jekologicheskogo pravosoznaniya [ormation of environmental legal consciousness] // Rossiya v sovremennom mire: politiko-pravovoj aspekt. Sbornik nauchnyh trudov III Mezhdunarodnoj nauchnoj konferencii. – Rostov n/D. – S. 297-301.

Jekologicheskij kodeks RK ot 2 janvarja 2021 goda [Environmental Code of the RK dated January 2, 2021] <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K2100000400>

Mazzone A., Yanagida T., Camodeca M., & Strohmeier D. (2021). Information processing of social exclusion: Links with bullying, moral disengagement and guilt. Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology, vol, 75 (May), 101292. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.appdev.2021.101292>

Meng-Meng Geng, Ling-Yun He (2021) Environmental Regulation, Environmental Awareness and Environmental Governance Satisfaction Sustainability, vol. 13, 3960 <https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>

Muhina I.D. Jekologicheskij pravoporjadok: problemy sodержaniya [Ecological legal order: problems of content] http://teoriapractica.ru/rus/files/arhiv_zhurnala/2015/9/law/mukhina.pdf

Ob administrativnyh pravonarushenijah Kodeks Respubliki Kazahstan ot 5 ijulja 2014 goda № 235-V ZRK. [On Administrative Offenses Code of the RK dated July 5, 2014 No. 235-V ZRK.] <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1400000235>

Peter-Christoph Storm (2000) Environmental Laws: Introduction. Wangen im Allgäu // <https://www.iuscomp.org/gla/literature/envirmt.htm>

Rashhupkina L.V. (2006) Jekologicheskij pravoporjadok: Obshheteoreticheskij analiz [Ecological law and order: General theoretical analysis.]. Avtoref. dis. kandidat jurid. Nauk. – Vladimir <https://www.dissertat.com/content/ekologicheskii-pravoporyadok-obshheteoreticheskii-analiz>

Rosa-Jiménez C., Nebot, N. (2021). Economic viability of neighborhood cooperatives for active aging. Malaga as a case study. Viabilidad económica de las cooperativas vecinales para el envejecimiento activo. Málaga como caso de estudio. Architecture, City and Environment, vol. 15(45), pp. 1-13.

Steblov A.L., Vajsman Ja.I. (2010) Jekologicheskoe pravo Rossijskoj Federacii i stran Evropejskogo soobshhestva [Environmental law of the Russian Federation and countries of the European Community]. Uchebnoe posobie: Perm', <https://lawbook.online/ekologicheskoe-pravo-rossii-kniga/ekologicheskii-pravoporyadok-sposobyi-ego-68141.html>

Sutrisno E. (2019). Pemaknaan Budaya Hukum: Menggagas Kesejahteraan Masyarakat. Bogor: In-Media

Syed Ussain Saheb, Sepuri Sessaiah and Buddolla Viswanath (2012) Environment and Their Legal Issues in India// International Research Journal of Environment Sciences, vol. 1(3), pp. 44-51.

Ugolovnyj kodeks RK ot 3 ijulja 2014 goda № 226-V ZRK. [Criminal Code of the RK dated July 3, 2014 No. 226-V ZRK.] https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1400000226/k226_

Vlasova Yu.V. (2019) Jekologicheskij pravoporjadok: ponjatie i sposoby zashhity [Ecological legal order: the concept and methods of protection] International Journal of Humanities and Natural Sciences, vol. 3-2. – Pp. 176-179.

3-бөлім
**ТАБИғИ РЕСУРС
ЖӘНЕ ЭКОЛОГИЯЛЫҚ ҚҰҚЫҚ**

Section 3
**NATURAL RESOURCE
AND ENVIRONMENTAL LAW**

Раздел 3
**ПРИРОДОРЕСУРСОВОЕ
И ЭКОЛОГИЧЕСКОЕ ПРАВО**